

**LOCAL GOVERNMENT BOUNDARY COMMISSION FOR WALES MEETING HELD ON
18th MARCH 2009 AT CARADOG HOUSE, CARDIFF.**

Commissioners

Mr P J Wood (Chairman)
Rev. H M Davies (Deputy Chairman)
Mr J Bader (Member)

Secretariat

Mr. E H Lewis (Secretary)
Mr. S Halsall
Mr. D Carr
Mrs. L Brough
Mr R. Handscomb

1. DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

1.1 There were no new interests declared.

2. MINUTES OF THE COMMISSION MEETING HELD ON 11th FEBRUARY 2009

2.1 These were agreed.

3. MATTERS ARISING

Finance Report 2008/09

3.1 It was reported that the Commission had now received the transformation costs from Merlin and the invoice would be paid in this financial year.

Public Sector Sustainable Procurement Assessment Framework

3.2 The Action plan had been sent to Value Wales at the end of February 2009.

4. Wales Audit Office Report – implementation progress

4.1 Further work was being undertaken on the Corporate Plan and the Newsletter had been developed and distributed in response to the recommendation that communications with stakeholders be improved. A draft outline of the Strategic Plan would go to the May meeting. A reply had also been received from the WAG Permanent Secretary regarding the Management Statement and Financial Memorandum (MSFM). The letter indicated that the Commission would receive a final version shortly after the publication of the revised model. The revised model exercise is due to finish by the end of this financial year. **It was agreed** that the Chair would write to the Permanent Secretary if MSFM was not received within the timescale indicated in the letter.

5. SWANSEA COMMUNITY REVIEW – CONSIDERATION OF DRAFT REPRESENTATIONS

- 5.1 The Commission had received several representations in response to their Draft Report which included proposals for boundary changes that had not been previously considered. In order for these representations to be put out to consultation the Commission would need to publish Second Draft Proposals on them. **It was agreed** that the Commission would publish a Second Draft Proposals Report in respect of these new proposals.

Llanrhidian Higher

- 5.2 It was reported that a representation had been received including a petition of over 400 signatures in support of the Commission's suggestion that the Three Crosses Ward of the Community of Llanrhidian Higher break away to form a separate Community. **It was agreed** that suggestion would now be adopted as a proposal for the Final Report.
- 5.3 In respect of the change to the boundaries of the Wards of Penclawdd and Llanmorlais **it was agreed** that this suggestion would be adopted as a proposal for a consequential change to the electoral arrangements of the Community of Llanrhidian Higher for the Final Report.

Llangyfelach / Pontlliw and Tircoed

- 5.4 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Llangyfelach and Pontlliw and Tircoed had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and no objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Llangyfelach / Mynyddbach

- 5.5 It was reported that the Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Llangyfelach and Mynyddbach had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and no objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Cockett / Townhill

- 5.6 It was reported that the Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Cockett and Townhill had been objected to by Swansea City and County Council and several local councillors. No representations had been received supporting the proposed change. Swansea City and County Council had considered that the existing boundary should be kept whilst the local councillors had said that the whole of Webbon Way should be included within the Community of Townhill.
- 5.7 Members considered that the existing boundary presented an anomaly which needed to be addressed. As the Commission's original proposal which had included the transfer of electors had not been supported it was considered that the proposal put forward by the local councillors was to be preferred as no electors were involved. **It was agreed** that the Commission would include the local councillors' proposal to move the whole of Webbon Way into the Community of Townhill in the Final Report.

Cockett / Penderry

- 5.8 It was reported that the Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Cockett and Penderry at Llwyn Teg and Pontardulais Retail Park had been supported by the Rt. Hon. Alan Williams MP. It had been objected to by Swansea City and County Council and the Penderry Ward Labour Party. An alternative proposal had been put forward by several local councillors that would move the properties at Llwyn Teg from the Community of Penderry into the Community of Cockett but leaving the Pontardulais Road Retail Park in the Community of Penderry.
- 5.9 Members considered that the existing boundary presented an anomaly which needed to be addressed. The alternative proposal put forward by the local councillors failed to address the anomaly of the existing boundary dividing the Pontardulais Retail Park. **It was agreed** that the Commission's original proposal to move Llwyn Teg and the Pontardulais Road Retail Park from the Community of Penderry into the Community of Cockett would be included in the Final Report as it presented the best choice in terms of community of interest, access and clearly defined boundary.
- 5.10 It was reported that the Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Cockett and Penderry at Courtlands Way and surrounding area had been supported by the Rt. Hon. Alan Williams MP. It had been objected to by Swansea City and County Council and the Penderry Ward Labour Party. An alternative proposal had been put forward by several local councillors that would transfer the properties at Courtlands Way from the Community of Cockett into the Community of Penderry.
- 5.11 Members considered that the existing boundary presented an anomaly in terms of access to the roads adjoining Courtlands Way which needed to be addressed. The alternative proposal put forward by the local councillors failed to address the anomaly of the existing boundary as access to Courtlands Way would still remain through the Community of Cockett. **It was agreed** that the Commission's original proposal to transfer Courtlands Way, Beaufort Court, Richmond Way, Cranmer Court and Chantry Court from the Community of Penderry into the Community of Cockett would be included in the Final Report as it presented the best option in terms of community of interest, access and clearly defined boundary.

Landore / Morriston

- 5.9 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Landore and Morriston at the Plasmarl Industrial Estate had resulted in representations from Swansea City and County Council and a local councillor. They had both made an alternative proposal that the recreation facilities to the south of the Industrial Estate be excluded from the proposed transfer and remain within the Community of Landore. The Commission accepted that the alternative proposal would still address the existing boundary anomaly whilst leaving the recreation facilities associated with the Community of Landore within that Community. **It was agreed** that the Commission would include the alternative proposal to move only the Plasmarl Industrial Estate and not the recreation grounds from the Community of Landore into the Community of Morriston in the Final Report.

Bonymaen / Llansamlet

- 5.10 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Bonymaen and Llansamlet had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and no objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Penllergaer / Llchwyr

- 5.11 It was reported that the Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Penllergaer and Llchwyr at Garngoch Hospital had been supported by Swansea City and County Council. The Proposal had been objected to by Edwina Hart AM and a local councillor. An alternative proposal had been put forward by Llchwyr Town Council which retained part of the Commission's original proposal but left Garngoch Hospital within the Community of Llchwyr. The Commission considered the argument put forward by both Llchwyr Town Council and the local councillor that there was no historic link between Garngoch Hospital and Penllergaer. **It was agreed** that the Commission would include the alternative proposal to move only the part of the Community of Llchwyr not containing Garngoch Hospital from the Community of Llchwyr into the Community of Penllergaer in the Final Report.

Penllergaer / Llangyfelach

- 5.12 The suggested change to the boundary between the Communities of Penllergaer and Llangyfelach at Penllergaer Valley Woods had been supported by the local councillor who had originally put it forward and had received no other support. **It was agreed** that this suggestion would not be included in the Final Report.

Clydach / Birchgrove

- 5.13 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Clydach and Birchgrove to include the whole village of Glais within the Community of Birchgrove had received support from five representations including a petition of 63 signatures. The proposal had been objected to by Swansea City and County Council and Clydach Community Council. Members considered the arguments presented by both sides which claimed that Glais had historic links with either Clydach or Birchgrove. Clydach Community Council also claimed that Glais residents used Clydach facilities. Members considered that Glais Village was a single entity which should be wholly within one community. They noted that residents used the facilities in Clydach and that the village was situated closer to similar built up areas in Clydach than Birchgrove and that it fell more within the Swansea Valley. **It was agreed** that the Commission would propose that the whole of the Glais Village be included within the Community of Clydach for their Final Report.

Dunvant / Upper Killay

- 5.14 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Dunvant and Upper Killay at Ddol Road had been supported by Swansea City and

County Council and no objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Clydach / Morriston

- 5.15 It was reported that the Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Clydach and Morriston had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and Clydach Community Council. Clydach Community Council also considered that the area of Pen-y-Rhedyn should be moved from the Community of Morriston into the Community of Clydach. Members considered, however, that the area of Pen-y-Rhedyn was of a similar rural nature to the surrounding area of Morriston. The proposal was objected to by a local councillor who said that access to Pen-y-Rhedyn would only be through Clydach if the proposed boundary realignment were put in place. It was noted, however, that staff had determined during a site visit that Pen-y-Rhedyn could be reached from either Morriston or Clydach. **It was agreed** that the Commission would keep their original proposal to transfer Caermawr but not Pen-y-Rhedyn from Morriston into Clydach for the Final Report.

Llangyfelach / Morriston

- 5.16 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Llangyfelach and Morriston at Pant Lasau Road had been supported by Swansea City and County Council. However, the Council had also suggested the Commission may wish to move the area into the Community of Mawr as a possible choice. Mawr Community Council said that they considered that the area should be transferred into their Community area. Members considered that the location and shape of the area to be transferred meant that it would more readily and conveniently fit in with the adjacent area of Llangyfelach rather than Mawr. **It was agreed** that the Commission would retain their original proposal to move the area along Pant Lasau Road from the Community of Morriston into the Community of Llangyfelach for the Final Report.

Townhill

- 5.17 The Commission's suggestion in the Draft Report was that the Community of Townhill be divided into two separate communities of Townhill and Mayhill. Representations had been received both supporting and objecting to this proposal and Members considered that the arguments on both sides were valid. It was noted that Townhill did not have a community council and that facilities were shared throughout the community. It was also considered that there was slightly more weight of representation for retaining the existing arrangement. **It was agreed** that it would be more in the interests of effective and convenient local government for the existing community arrangement for Townhill to be retained.

Townhill / Castle

- 5.18 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Townhill and Castle at Nicander Place had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and no objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Penderry / Cwmbwrla

- 5.19 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Penderry and Cwmbwrla at Brenig Road had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and Penderry Ward Labour Party. No objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Gorseinon / Grovesend and Waungron

- 5.20 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Gorseinon and Grovesend and Waungron had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and Gorseinon Town Council. No objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Gorseinon / Llchwyr

- 5.21 It was reported that the Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Gorseinon and Llchwyr had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and Gorseinon Town Council. It had been objected to by Edwina Hart and Llchwyr Town Council. Llchwyr Town Council had submitted a counter-proposal to realign the boundary to the north of the existing boundary. Members considered that their original proposal presented a clearly defined and logical boundary which resolved the existing anomaly of sole access to the properties in the area being through a different community. The counter-proposal put forward by Llchwyr Town Council did not resolve the issue of access to the properties being solely through the Community of Gorseinon and it was noted that the type of properties were different to those adjacent properties in the Community of Llchwyr. **It was agreed** that the Commission would retain their original proposal to transfer the area of Heol Pant y Dwr and Clos y Nant from the Community of Morriston into the Community of Llangyfelach for the Final Report.
- 5.22 The Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Gorseinon and Llchwyr had been supported by Swansea City and County Council, Llchwyr Town Council and Gorseinon Town Council. No objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Gorseinon / Penllergaer

- 5.22 It was reported that the Commission's proposed change to the boundary between the Communities of Gorseinon and Penllergaer had been supported by Swansea City and County Council and Gorseinon Town Council. No objections had been received. **It was agreed** that this proposal would be included in the Final Report.

Castle / Landore

- 5.23 Swansea City and County Council had submitted a new proposal to transfer a number of properties at Pentre from the Community of Castle into the Community of Landore. The Secretariat had undertaken a site visit to the area and found that the proposed boundary was clearly defined and was an improvement in terms of access to the properties involved which was mainly through the Community of Landore. **It was agreed** that the Commission would adopt this proposal for their Second Draft Report.

Cockett / Penderry

- 5.24 It was reported that Swansea City and County Council and several local councillors had submitted a new proposal to move a number of properties at Heol Calfin, Ffordd y Brain and Rhodfa'r Brain from the Community of Cockett into the Community of Penderry. Members could see little evidence that such a realignment of the boundary would be in the interests of effective and convenient local government and considered that the existing boundary appeared logical and clearly defined. **It was agreed** that the Commission would report this suggestion in their Second Draft Report but not adopt it as a proposal.

Bishopston / Pennard

- 5.25 A local councillor had submitted a new proposal to move a property together with adjoining buildings from the Community of Pennard into the Community of Bishopston. The Secretariat had undertaken a site visit to the area and found that the proposed boundary was clearly defined and was logical in terms of access to the property involved which was through the Community of Bishopston. **It was agreed** that the Commission would adopt this proposal for their Second Draft Report.
- 5.26 It was reported that a local councillor had submitted a new proposal to transfer a number of properties in the vicinity of Cliff Cottage from the Community of Pennard into the Community of Bishopston as access to those properties was through the Community of Bishopston. However, it had been noted from maps of the area that access to the properties was from the Community of Pennard. **It was agreed** that the Commission would report this suggestion in their Second Draft Report but not adopt it as a proposal.

Bishopston / Mumbles

- 5.27 A local councillor had submitted a new proposal to move a number of commercial properties at Caswell Bay from the Community of Mumbles into the Community of Bishopston as the sea front commercial area was divided by the existing boundary. Members considered that there was little evidence that such a realignment of the boundary would be in the interests of effective and convenient local government and considered that as no electors were involved the existing boundary could be retained. **It was agreed** that the Commission would report this suggestion in their Second Draft Report but not adopt it as a proposal.

Mawr / Llangyfelach

- 5.28 Mawr Community Council had submitted a proposal that the boundary between the Communities of Mawr and Llangyfelach be realigned along the M4 / Llangyfelach Road. Members considered that such a change to the boundary would involve the transfer of a substantial area of the Community of Llangyfelach into the Community of Mawr and that the area involved was of a similar nature to the adjacent areas in the Community of Llangyfelach. **It was agreed** that the Commission would report this suggestion in their Second Draft Report but not adopt it as a proposal.

Mawr / Pontardulais

- 5.29 Mawr Community Council had submitted a proposal that the boundary between the Communities of Mawr and Pontardulais be realigned to transfer the area of Cwm Dulais from the Community of Pontardulais into the Community of Mawr. Members considered that the area of Cwm Dulais was of a similar rural nature to the adjacent areas of Pontardulais to the north and south. Cwm Dulais was also closer to an urban area of Pontardulais than any similar area in Mawr. **It was agreed** that the Commission would report this suggestion in their Second Draft Report but not adopt it as a proposal.

Clydach – Baran Carnllechart

- 5.30 Clydach Community Council had submitted a proposal that the area of Baran Carnllechart, Gellionnen be transferred into their Community. The Secretariat, however, could not locate this area on the map. It was suspected that Baran Carnllechart, Gellionnen was within the County Borough of Neath Port Talbot and therefore outside the remit of the Swansea Community Review. **It was agreed** that the Commission would report this suggestion in their Second Draft Report but reject it as being outside the scope of the Swansea review.

6. BRIDGEND COMMUNITY REVIEW – FURTHER CONSIDERATION.

- 6.1 At the February meeting, the Final Proposals report for Bridgend Community review was agreed subject to legal advice and minor changes. This was referred to the Commission's Legal Advisor who made some suggestions about the content.
- 6.2 The Commissioners considered the original decision made on the boundary between Bridgend Town Council and Merthyr Mawr Community Council. Two revised options were as follows:
- Option 1 - de minimus which would be to amend the boundary at Island Farm itself to take only those properties into Merthyr Mawr; or
 - Option 2 - An amendment which in part may look more like the original proposal of using the A48 as a boundary.
- 6.3 **It was agreed** the Commission would go with option 1 as they considered that this option was in the interests of convenient and effective local government. This would address the anomaly at Island Farm Estate.

7. ELECTORAL REVIEWS

- 7.1 Members noted the updated timetable and it was reported that the first tranche of Electoral Reviews was under way. Some of the Electoral reviews had been moved back to ensure that they did not start until after their corresponding community reviews had been completed. It would be necessary to write to the Local Government Minister concerning the Commission's ability to adhere to the timetable deadline for completing the reviews as this was dependent on the timeliness of the Welsh Assembly Government drafting and issuing Orders. **It was**

agreed that the Secretary would draft a letter for the Chairman to send to the Local Government Minister.

- 7.2 It was noted that the delays to the Caerphilly and Swansea Community reviews may mean that these electoral reviews may need to be put back in the timetable. There was a possibility that Conwy could be moved forward and also Ceredigion if the Council did not undertake a community review. **It was agreed** to write to Ceredigion County Council to ask if they intend proceeding with a community review in their area.
- 7.3 It was reported that the Newport Presentation would take place on the 24th March 2009. **It was agreed** that the Chairman and Secretary would attend. The Neath Port Talbot presentation would take place on the 1st & 9th April 2009. **It was agreed** that the Commission Member and the Secretary would attend. The Denbighshire presentation would take place on the 7th April 2009. **It was agreed** that the Deputy Chairman and the Secretary would attend. No arrangements had been made for the Flintshire presentation to date.
- 7.4 A complaint had been received about the Commission not referring to Newport as a City. An explanation was given concerning the legal issues and the advice now received from the Legal Advisor. The matter had been resolved. **It was agreed** that a report would go to the next Audit Committee to provide a record of the issues raised.
- 7.5 It was reported that the Chairman and Secretary would be visiting the Local Government Boundary Commission for Scotland (LGBCS) on a fact finding mission for the electoral reviews. They would be looking at the LGBCS system for categorising representation for rural areas to see if such a system could be adopted by the Commission.

8. PUBLICATION SCHEME

- 8.1 It was noted that the publication scheme had now been completed. **It was agreed** that the revised scheme be accepted and would be reviewed every March to decide what would be published.

9. REVIEW OF THE BOUNDARY BETWEEN THE PRESERVED COUNTIES OF POWYS AND MID GLAMORGAN IN THE AREA OF PONTSTICILL

- 9.1 It was reported that the Local Government Minister had issued the direction for the review of the boundary between the preserved counties of Powys and Mid Glamorgan in the area of Pontsticill. The initial stage of the Review would begin shortly and the Secretariat would seek to complete this through correspondence.

10. IMPROVING COMMUNICATION 2009/2010

- 10.1 The Commission considered the implications and benefits of having a stand at the Welsh Local Government Association (WLGA) and One Voice Wales (OVW) annual conferences. **It was agreed** that the feasibility of having a stand at the

WLGA conference would be investigated in order to raise awareness of the current Electoral Reviews. **It was agreed** that the Commission would have a stand at OVW to raise awareness of the Commissions general role and Community reviews.

10.2 **It was agreed** that the Chairman and Member would go to the WLGA conference as delegates. In addition 2 members of the secretariat would be required to man the stand. Arrangements for attending the OVW conference would be decided at a later date.

10.3 **It was agreed** that the Secretary would design a leaflet to be used at both events. It was considered that the first Newsletter would be sufficient for use at the event, but it would need to be updated to include reference to the Electoral Reviews and would be known as the Conference Edition.

10.4 **It was agreed** that that the Secretariat would organise the purchase of conference products, such as coasters, mugs and pens bearing the Commission's logo and telephone number. **It was agreed** that polo shirts, fleeces and good quality name badges with the Commission's logo would purchased for staff.

11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Remit Letter

11.1 The Commission had now received the Remit letter from the Sponsor Division. The Commission considered the content of the letter which would now need to be incorporated into the Operational plan. **It was agreed** that the revised Operational Plan would be considered at the May meeting, which would delay the submission to the Sponsor Division. **It was agreed** that the Secretary would draft a letter for the Chairman responding to the Remit letter. **It was agreed** that a copy of the 'Shared Responsibilities' document would be circulated to all Commissioners.

Video Conferencing (VC)

11.2 It was reported that the Secretary had looked in to the possibilities and costs of obtaining VC in the Commission. The most cost effective option would be to share the VC facilities with other AGSBs in the Cardiff area. **It was agreed** that this possibility would be pursued by the Secretary.

Guidance Note

11.3 Members noted the revised Guidance note and were given 48 hours to comment.

Opening Doors Charter

11.4 The Commission noted the Opening Doors Charter, which is being promoted to all Public bodies by Value Wales. The Charter is for small and medium enterprise (SME) friendly procurement and is aimed at breaking down barriers and setting a minimum level of good practice for the public sector and SMEs. **It was agreed** that the Commission would sign up to the Charter. By signing up to the Charter

this would enable the Commission to reach level 3 as required in the Sustainable Procurement Assessment Framework (SPAF).

12. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

12.1 The dates of the next meeting were set at:

12th May 2009

17th June 2009

15th July 2009

17th September 2009